Biomass recycling and Earth’s early phosphorus cycle

Michael A. Kipp1,2* and Eva E. Stüeken2,3

Phosphorus sets the pace of marine biological productivity on geological time scales. Recent estimates of Precambrian phosphorus levels suggest a severe deficit of this macronutrient, with the depletion attributed to scavenging by iron minerals. We propose that the size of the marine phosphorus reservoir was instead constrained by muted liberation of phosphorus during the remineralization of biomass. In the modern ocean, most biomass-bound phosphorus gets aerobically recycled; but a dearth of oxidizing power in Earth’s early oceans would have limited the stoichiometric capacity for remineralization, particularly during the Archean. The resulting low phosphorus concentrations would have substantially hampered primary productivity, contributing to the delayed rise of atmospheric oxygen.

INTRODUCTION

Phosphorus (P) availability is thought to dictate the amount of primary productivity that can be sustained in the oceans on geologic time scales (1, 2). Estimating P concentrations in the ocean across Earth’s history is thus critical for understanding the growth of the biosphere and the evolution of major biogeochemical cycles—namely, the rise of atmospheric oxygen, which requires substantial burial of organic carbon generated via oxygenic photosynthesis. Multiple proxies have been used to reconstruct P levels, including the P content of iron (Fe) oxide–rich sedimentary rocks (3–5) and marginal marine siliclastic sedimentary rocks (6). Although deriving quantitative assessments of P levels from these records has been notoriously difficult [for example, Bjerrum and Canfield (3) and Konhauser et al. (7)], recent work is beginning to converge on a low P ocean [<20% modern concentrations; modern, ~2 μM; (1, 2)], persisting in the Archean and perhaps through the Proterozoic (5, 6). The favored mechanism for P depletion in the Precambrian ocean is scavenging of P from the water column by incorporation into ferrous minerals or by adsorption onto Fe oxides (3, 5, 6). However, these models have not accounted for potential “upstream” throttles that could have kept P concentrations low without any influence of Fe scavenging. Here, we propose a new mechanism for maintaining low P: limited recycling of P in an oxidant-poor ocean.

The bioavailable P supply of the ocean derives almost entirely from riverine inputs, making P a scarce nutrient relative to carbon and nitrogen, which can be fixed from atmospheric sources (2). The modern riverine flux of bioavailable P is very small [~2 × 10^12 g/year; (8)] compared to the amount annually used by the marine biosphere [~1200 × 10^12 g/year; (8)]. This large discrepancy between supply and demand is sustained by the efficient recycling of P within the ocean. After the P in the surface ocean is exhausted during primary production, the remineralization of sinking biomass releases P back into the marine environment. This recycling increases the residence time of P in the ocean. As water masses mature in the deep ocean, they accumulate nutrients regenerated through biomass recycling and ultimately deliver these nutrients to the continental shelves via upwelling, enabling high rates of biological productivity. In the modern ocean, ~80 to 90% of primary productivity gets remineralized in the photic zone (upper, ~200 m; fig. S1), with most of the remainder being oxidized at depth or in marine sediments (9, 10). Only a very small percentage (<1%) of net primary productivity (and its associated P) escapes remineralization and is ultimately buried in marine sediments. Thus, the magnitude of the P recycling flux has probably always dwarfed riverine inputs, even if early Precambrian riverine fluxes were an order of magnitude higher than today (11).

A critical difference between Precambrian and modern oceans is the availability of electron acceptors needed for the oxidation of biomass. In the oxygenated modern ocean, most organic matter degradation occurs aerobically (12). Even when localized water masses or sedimentary pore waters become anoxic, there is an ample supply of anaerobic electron acceptors [for example, sulfate (SO_4^{2-})] to fuel biomass decomposition (13). Before the establishment of oxidizing conditions at Earth’s surface, it is conceivable that the recycling of organic matter was limited by a scarcity of electron acceptors. Inhibited organic remineralization would mean that a greater proportion of sinking organic matter was preserved in marine sediments (that is, higher burial efficiency). However, the limited regeneration of P in this system might maintain low steady-state P concentrations in the deep ocean and upwelling waters, which would ultimately limit net primary productivity, total organic burial, and oxygen genesis. We quantitatively explored this hypothesis by compiling estimates of the paleoconcentrations of the major electron acceptors in seawater (Fig. 1A) and stoichiometrically calculating the concentration of P that could have been maintained throughout Earth’s history.

The rationale for this approach comes from the observation that, in the modern ocean, the concentrations of P and oxygen in surface (P_s and O_2) and deep (P_d and O_2d) waters can be stoichiometrically equated using the chemical equation of aerobic decomposition and concomitant liberation of P (fig. S2) (12). This is based on the premise that all P in deep waters (P_d) derives from either (i) the release of P during the oxidation of organic matter or (ii) downwelling of nutrient-rich waters (P_r) from high latitudes that is driven by thermohaline circulation. Thus, P_d can be calculated as shown in Eq. 1, where r_{O_2} is the stoichiometric coefficient of the liberation of P from organic matter during aerobic respiration [120 to 200; average, 169; (12, 14)]

\[ P_d = P_s + \frac{[O_2d - O_2]}{r_{O_2}} \]  

This equation has been validated for the modern ocean (12) and has also been used to constrain Precambrian oxygen levels (14). It is therefore a reasonable approach to track first-order trends in ocean chemistry.

We modified this equation to explore the possibility of limited P recycling in the Precambrian (see the Supplementary Materials for detailed description). First, we added the contribution of anaerobic...
respiration pathways in descending order according to the thermodynamic favorability of the corresponding metabolic reaction (15). Stoichiometric coefficients (r_i) were taken from Canfield et al. (16). To assess the contribution of organic disproportionation reactions (that is, methanogenesis and fermentation), we derived an upper limit (P_{CH_4}) using modeled methanogenesis rates for the Precambrian. Scaling the modern rate of methane production in marine sediments [20 Tmol/year; (17)] to the rate modeled for the late Archean [96 Tmol/year; (18)]—a time that may have had exceptionally vigorous methanogenesis (Fig. 1B)—suggests that disproportionation of organic matter likely never contributed more than 0.1 μM of additional P recycling (see the Supplementary Materials for detailed calculation). We conservatively applied this value to all of our Precambrian calculations. The modified equation becomes

\[ P_d = P_s + \left[ \frac{[O_{2s} - O_{2d}]}{r_{O_2}} + \frac{[NO_{3s} - NO_{3d}]}{r_{NO_3}} + \frac{[MnO_{2s} - MnO_{2d}]}{r_{MnO_2}} + \frac{[FeOOH_x - FeOOH_4]}{r_{FeOOH}} + \frac{[SO_{4s} - SO_{4d}]}{r_{SO_4}} + P_{CH_4} \right] \]

which can be simplified by combining the total contribution of P recycling into a single term (P_{r}) such that

\[ P_d = P_s + P_r \]
Recent estimates (23, 24) place Archean \([\text{SO}_4^{2-}]\) at <10 µM, meaning that sulfate reduction would have contributed no more than 0.2 µM to \(P_r\) (Fig. 3). Levels of dissolved Fe\(^{3+}\) may have been as high as 1 mM if Fe\(^{2+}\) levels were constrained by greenalite solubility (25) and if all Fe\(^{2+}\) underwent oxidation to bioavailable Fe\(^{3+}\). In this scenario, iron reduction could theoretically have contributed up to 1.5 µM to \(P_r\) (Fig. 3A). However, this upper limit is unlikely for several reasons. First, a large fraction of Fe\(^{3+}\) may have settled out of the water column as solid particles without being used for organic remineralization. Second, siderite saturation may have kept Fe\(^{2+}\) levels below 120 µM (26), which would push P\(_r\) to <0.4 µM. Last, if microbial C/P stoichiometry shifted to higher levels under pervasive nutrient stress in the Precambrian (6), the effect of limited P recycling would become considerably more severe (Fig. 3, B and C). Furthermore, episodes of high Fe input into the ocean could have exerted a negative feedback on P availability. When Fe input was high, it may have allowed for a high degree of P recycling by Fe\(^{3+}\) respiration, but at the same time, high levels of Fe\(^{2+}\) in the water column could subsequently have scavenged liberated P. The net burden for sustaining a large reservoir of dissolved P may thus have rested primarily on microbial sulfate reducers (maximum \(P_r < 0.2\) µM). As a conservative estimate, we proceed with a value of <0.4 µM for \(P_r\) to allow for some contribution of Fe\(^{3+}\) respiration (Fig. 3A).

If we now add our most conservative estimate of P dissolved in surface waters (\(P_s\)), our maximum calculated \(P_d\) value is <0.8 µM for the Archean. This is <40% of modern values and is likely an overestimate for the reasons outlined above. Actual concentrations could have been substantially lower, particularly if bacteria adjusted their C/P ratios to higher values (Fig. 3), or if thermohaline circulation was less effective than today. These upper limits agree well with recent estimates of Archean P concentrations [0.04 to 0.38 µM; (5, 6)].

However, our model allows for high P levels in the Proterozoic after growth of the seawater sulfate reservoir (Fig. 4), in contrast to recent proxy evidence (6). There are a few possible solutions to this disagreement: (i) P recycling may have been operating more effectively in the Proterozoic, but Fe scavenging depleted this recycled P and became the most significant sink for P, thus maintaining low P levels until the latest Proterozoic. (ii) Alternatively, P recycling may still have been inhibited if the marine sulfate reservoir was not quantitatively utilized, such that the full oxidation potential was not exploited. This would be consistent with an increase in the spread of \(\delta^{34}S\) values of Proterozoic sedimentary sulfides, which indicate nonquantitative sulfate reduction in the marine environment (14). (iii) Last, if C/P ratios were significantly elevated above modern values, then even moderate P recycling could still have kept the P reservoir small in the Proterozoic (Fig. 4). It is therefore conceivable that electron acceptor limitation for P liberation extended into the Proterozoic eon.

**DISCUSSION**

These results carry several important implications. First, oxidant-limited recycling of P, rather than scavenging by Fe minerals, probably exerted the major control on P availability in the Archean, because secondary P-bearing minerals cannot form if P remains bound to organic matter. However, Fe scavenging could have become the major P sink in the Proterozoic if P recycling became more efficient (Figs. 2 and 4). This would require that electron acceptors were nearly fully exploited, which is not the case today. Our model does not require...
higher-than-modern organic carbon concentrations in Archean sedimentary rocks but instead a relatively larger proportion of preservation of primary productivity, which would, in turn, have been suppressed with a lower P availability. The severity of this P scarcity imposed by limited biomass recycling increases substantially if bacterial C/P ratios were higher in the Precambrian (Figs. 3 and 4). In such scenarios, the formation of authigenic P-bearing mineral phases (for example, CFA) may have been inhibited by the lower P input to marine sediments (6).

Second, our results suggest that in the Archean, microbial iron and sulfate reduction played an essential role in sustaining biological productivity by conducting the vast majority of P recycling within the ocean system (Fig. 3). The contributions of these two pathways may have been comparable despite a greater abundance of Fe$^{3+}$ than SO$_4^{2-}$ in Archean seawater, because sulfate reduction involves a transfer of eight electrons compared to one electron in iron reduction, meaning that more P can be liberated per molecule. Before the onset of significant oxidative continental weathering (27), the major source of SO$_4^{2-}$ to the ocean would have been photolysis of volcanic SO$_2$ (28). Our results thus highlight the potential importance of the role of volcanic weathering in sustaining a significant biosphere on an anoxic planet by sourcing SO$_4^{2-}$ to the ocean where it could contribute to biomass recycling. In addition, the contribution of iron reduction to P recycling may have been sensitive to secular changes in heat flow and pulses in hydrothermal Fe inputs. These results thus illustrate another strong linkage between biological and planetary evolution.

Last, our proposed mechanism for low Archean P levels may help explain the delay between the earliest compelling evidence of oxygenic photosynthesis at ~3.0 Ga (29) and the accumulation of atmospheric oxygen during the GOE (21). It has long been recognized (30) that under near-modern rates of primary productivity, it is difficult to satisfy redox balance at Earth’s surface while keeping atmospheric oxygen levels extremely low (31). However, if suppressed recycling of biomass limited the P supply, then lower rates of primary productivity would alleviate the troubles with the Archean redox budget due to diminished biospheric oxygen production. This P-limited state could have been exited as incipient oxidation began on Earth’s surface, delivering sulfate to the marine environment (27), thus increasing productivity and oxygenesis, culminating in the GOE.

**METHODS**

We modified the box model approach used by Sarmiento et al. (12) to calculate dissolved P concentrations in the Precambrian oceans. This model relates deep (O$_{2d}$) and surface (O$_{2s}$) ocean oxygen concentrations by recognizing that their difference is equivalent to the amount of oxygen consumed during the oxidation of sinking organic matter, and that this can be stoichiometrically equated to the difference in surface and deep ocean P levels ($P_\text{d} - P_\text{s}$). This relationship can thus be expressed

$$O_{2d} = O_{2s} - r(P_\text{d} - P_\text{s}) \quad (4)$$

where $r$ is the stoichiometric coefficient of the liberation of P from biomass during aerobic remineralization (see model schematic in fig. S2). If P were not selectively remineralized during organic degradation, then $r$ would approximately equal the Redfield C/P ratio of primary producers (for example, 106) due to the 1:1 O$_2$/C stoichiometry of aerobic respiration. However, it is known that P is selectively released from organic matter during decomposition reactions (32), meaning that $r$ is greater than the Redfield C/P ratio. The value of $r$ has typically been estimated at 169 (12, 14, 33), although observations range from 120 to 200 in the modern ocean (34). We therefore used 169 as our preferred value and explored the range from 120 to 200 to establish our confidence interval.

Equation 4 can then be used to predict deep ocean oxygen concentrations if all other parameters are known. In order for this model to accurately capture the dynamics of the modern ocean, however, it is necessary to use O$_{2s}$ and P$_s$ values from high-latitude waters, because these water masses currently feed the deep ocean (12). Failure to do so will generate very low (or negative) O$_{2d}$ values, because some of the P in the deep ocean today derives from these downwelling nutrient-rich waters. Solving the equation with published P concentrations [$P_\text{d} = 1.7$ to $2.3$ μM (2, 5, 12, 35); $P_\text{s} = 0.7$ to $1.24$ μM (12, 35)] and using an O$_{2s}$ value of 325 μM — representative of high-latitude surface waters (12) — yields an O$_{2d}$ value of approximately 156 μM (confidence interval, 110 to 185 μM), which is in good agreement with oceanographic observations (12, 36).

To instead solve for deep ocean P concentrations, the equation can be rearranged

$$P_\text{d} = P_\text{s} + \frac{[O_{2s} - O_{2d}]}{rO_2} \quad (5)$$

The amount of P in the deep ocean is thus shown to be equivalent to the amount sourced from nutrient-rich downwelling waters plus the amount liberated during biomass recycling.

We further modified the box model to include additional electron acceptors representing the most globally significant anaerobic metabolic pathways (fig. S2B). Although these pathways have a relatively minor role in P regeneration in the modern ocean, the reducing oceans of the Precambrian would have featured predominantly anaerobic microbial metabolisms (see main text for discussion).

**SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIALS**

Supplementary material for this article is available at http://advances.sciencemag.org/cgi/content/full/3/11/eaao4795/DC1
REFERENCES AND NOTES


Downloaded from http://advances.sciencemag.org/

Acknowledgments: We thank R. Buick for formative discussions during the preparation of this manuscript. We also thank associate editor J. Middelburg, as well as C. Reinhard and two anonymous reviewers whose comments greatly improved this paper. Funding: This work was supported by NSF Graduate Research Fellowship DGE-1256082 to M.A.K., a NASA Postdoctoral Fellowship to E.E.S., NASA Exobiology grant NNX16AI37G, and NASA Astrobiology Institute grant NNA13AA93A. Author contributions: M.A.K. and E.E.S. conducted the calculations and wrote the paper, with substantial contributions from C. A. Partin, H. Tsikos, L. Chou, T. W. Lyons, S. J. Hayes, and M. A. Kipp and E. E. Stüeken, Biomass recycling and Earth’s early phosphorus cycle. Sci. Adv. 3, eaao4795 (2017).
Biomass recycling and Earth's early phosphorus cycle

Michael A. Kipp and Eva E. Stüeken

Sci Adv 3 (11), eaao4795.
DOI: 10.1126/sciadv.aao4795